

MINUTES OF THE
NATIONAL COLLEGIATE ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION
DIVISION III FINANCIAL AID COMMITTEE

Savannah Marriott Riverfront
Savannah, Georgia

November 2-3, 2006

Participants:

Patricia Blodgett, Keene State College
Paul Boyer, Williams College
David Ellis, Emerson College
Travis Feezell, Macalester College
Sara Beth Holman, Lawrence University
Kevin McHugh, The College of New Jersey
Dan Preston, Linfield College, chair
Garnett Purnell, Wittenberg University
Ellen Shilkret, Vassar College
Debra Townsley, Nichols College
Richard Woodland, Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey, Camden
Matthew Banker, NCAA, recording secretary
Eric Hartung, NCAA
Ann Kearns, NCAA

Dennis Hefner, State University College at Fredonia; and Charnele Kemper, NCAA, were unable to participate in this meeting.

Leah Nilsson, NCAA, was in attendance for portions of this meeting.

[Note: These minutes contain only actions taken (formal votes or stated "sense of the meeting") in accordance with NCAA policy regarding minutes of all Association entities. While certain items on the committee's agenda were acted on at various times throughout the meeting, all final actions within a given topic are combined in these minutes for convenience of reference.]

Thursday, November 2

The meeting was called to order at 8:07 a.m. by the chair, Mr. Preston.

NCAA Division III Financial Aid Committee

Minutes

November 2-3, 2006

Page No. 2

1. Welcome and announcements. Mr. Preston welcomed the NCAA Division III Financial Aid Committee members and advised the committee on logistical issues over the course of the two-day meeting. Each committee member and NCAA staff member introduced themselves to the full committee.

2. Division III Financial Aid Committee roster. Mr. Preston referred to the 2006-07 Financial Aid Committee roster as an informational item and noted that Ms. Blodgett and Mr. Boyer are participating in their final in-person committee meeting and will complete their committee tenure at the conclusion of the 2007 NCAA Convention. Two new committee members will be joining the committee at the conclusion of the 2007 Convention. The committee accepted the information.

3. October 12 Division III Financial Aid Committee teleconference minutes. Mr. Preston referred to the draft of the October 12 minutes. The committee reviewed the draft and took the following action:

It was VOTED

"To adopt the October 12 teleconference minutes as amended."

4. Financial aid reporting process timeline. The committee reviewed the reporting process timeline noting that 2006-07 Level I review decisions made by the committee will be forwarded to Division III institutions by December 1. NCAA staff updated the committee on presentations that will be made by staff and committee members at several educational-outreach sessions, including the Faculty Athletics Representatives Fall Forum this November, the NCAA Regional Rules Seminars in May and June 2007, the National Association of Collegiate Directors of Athletics Convention in June 2007, the National Association of Student Financial Aid Administrators Convention in July 2007 and the National Association of College Admissions Counselors Convention in October 2007.

The committee affirmed that these educational sessions are important outreach opportunities to further explain Division III financial aid legislation and the reporting process and should remain a part of the committee's emphasis on educating the Division III membership on financial aid issues. The committee identified future points of emphasis for educating the Division III membership on financial aid including further explanation of the four-percent variance threshold and the new Level I review filters, the impact and role of NCAA enforcement services in the reporting process and the legislative prohibition against

the consideration of athletics ability, participation or performance in leadership or extracurricular activities when determining financial aid packages.

5. Level I review totals. The committee reviewed the totals for 2006-07 submissions, Level I reviews and the breakdown of Level I variances and new filters that triggered an institution to be reviewed during the 2006-07 Level I review process. Specifically, 435 Division III institutions were required to submit financial aid data with two institutions exempted from submitting financial aid data because, per institutional policy, they do provide institutional gift aid. NCAA staff originally identified 118 institutions for Level I reviews but 27 Level I review cases that were solely triggered by the new sport-group filter were removed from a Level I review based on recommendation from an NCAA research consultant and NCAA research staff to further refine this filter before implementing in future reporting years. The NCAA staff advised the committee that the review of institutional financial aid data by sport groups remains part of the committee's analysis of institutions moving through the review process and could prompt Level II inquiries based on committee recommendations. The NCAA staff and committee noted that institutional sport-group data has been captured in Table 7 of all institutional reports since the inception of the reporting process. Based on the removal of 27 cases, NCAA staff confirmed that 91 cases will be reviewed by the committee during the 2006-07 Level I review, which represent approximately 21 percent of the Division III membership.

6. Review of Division III financial aid legislation and updates on 2005-06 case reviews. The NCAA staff reviewed Division III financial aid legislation per NCAA Bylaw 15 with the committee. The NCAA staff confirmed that institutions may not make a written offer of institutional financial aid until a prospective student-athlete has been admitted to the institution. The NCAA staff clarified that institutional grant-aid calculations or estimates provided to prospective student-athletes do not equate to a written offer of financial aid and providing this information to prospective student-athletes who have not been admitted to an institution would not be considered a violation.

The NCAA staff updated the committee on the 25 institutions that were forwarded to NCAA enforcement services at the conclusion of the 2005-06 reporting process. The NCAA staff noted that, in consultation with the committee, it determined that seven of the 25 institutions were in compliance with Division III financial aid legislation on receipt of additional clarifying institutional-packaging policy information. The committee requested that any institution required by NCAA enforcement services to revise their institutional financial aid packaging policy provide a copy of the revised policy to NCAA enforcement services and for the committee's review, on request.

The committee also recommended that the NCAA enforcement services establish a deadline prior to the start of the reporting-process cycle for institutions to satisfy all enforcement penalties and corrective actions for financial aid violations originating from the previous reporting-process cycle.

7. Conducting Level I reviews. The NCAA staff recommended a new review strategy for the committee's Level I reviews that include grouping cases with similar statistical, historical and/or review-process backgrounds to ensure further consistency in reviews of cases. The NCAA staff confirmed that moving multiple cases as a package still allows for pinpointed analysis on each case within a group. The NCAA staff also confirmed that not all Level I review cases are being grouped together and that the committee maintains full authority to not move groups of cases as a package at anytime, noting that the committee may pull any case review from a grouping for singular review. The NCAA staff reminded the committee that Level I review decisions result in one-of-three outcomes: (1) accept; (2) accept with conditions; or (3) forward to Level II review. The NCAA staff reminded the committee that forwarding institutions to a Level II review includes requesting institutions to provide written justifications for its financial aid variance and other data subsets within an institution's final detailed report that may reflect advantages to student-athletes in packaging financial aid based on athletics considerations. The committee noted that Level I review decisions will be communicated to the institutions by December 1.

The committee discussed and analyzed 91 Level I review cases and took the following actions:

It was VOTED

"To approve the following 23 2006-07 Level I review cases:

2005-4-01;	2005-3-04;
2005-4-05;	2005-3-12;
2005-4-06;	2005-2-13;
2005-4-09;	2005-2-16;
2006-1-18;	2005-3-09;
2006-1-21;	2005-1-07;
2006-1-23;	2005-4-07;
2005-4-10;	2006-2-31;
2005-1-01;	2006-2-32;
2005-2-05;	2006-1-10;
2005-2-07;	2006-1-12; and
2005-3-03."	

NCAA Division III Financial Aid Committee

Minutes

November 2-3, 2006

Page No. 5

It was VOTED

"To approve with conditions the following 38 2006-07 Level I review cases:

2006-2-13;	2005-3-17;
2006-1-14;	2005-3-19;
2005-1-02;	2005-4-02;
2005-1-04;	2005-1-13;
2005-2-06;	2005-1-14;
2005-3-07;	2005-2-12;
2005-3-10;	2005-2-04;
2005-3-08;	2005-3-02;
2005-4-03;	2005-1-09;
2005-1-03;	2005-3-15;
2005-1-06;	2006-2-14;
2005-1-08;	2006-1-05;
2005-1-11;	2006-1-07;
2005-1-15;	2006-1-11;
2005-1-16;	2006-1-15;
2005-2-01;	2006-1-20;
2005-2-02;	2005-1-17;
2005-2-14;	2005-2-03;
2005-3-11; and	2005-3-13."

It was VOTED

"To forward for a Level II review the following 30 2006-07 Level I review cases:

2005-4-04;	2006-1-09;
2006-2-11;	2006-1-16;
2005-2-10;	2006-1-17;
2005-3-14;	2006-1-19;
2005-3-01;	2006-1-22;
2005-1-05;	2006-1-24;
2005-3-16;	2006-3-01;
2006-2-05;	2006-3-02;
2006-1-01;	2006-3-03;
2006-1-02;	2006-3-04;
2006-1-04;	2006-3-05;
2006-1-06;	2006-3-06;
2006-1-08;	2006-3-07;

2006-3-08;
2006-3-09."

2006-1-13; and

[During its Level I reviews, the committee recessed at 4:45 p.m. Thursday, November 2.]

Friday, November 3

The committee reconvened for Level I reviews and the remaining committee business at 8:05 a.m. Friday, November 3. All members were present as noted above.

8. Providing guidance to institutions producing Level II written justifications. The committee discussed how it and the NCAA staff may better articulate the expectations of Level II review responses to questions forwarded by the committee to institutions under a Level II review. The committee noted that a Level II review template is being provided to all institutions under a Level II review. The template outlines several standard questions for institutions to answer as it produces its Level II review written justification. In addition to the questions in the template, the NCAA staff will also forward specific questions identified by the committee for an institutional response. Finally, the committee recommended that the NCAA staff continue to consult institutional staff members working on its institution's Level II written justification by providing, as necessary, sample written justifications that clearly and thoroughly articulate answers to committee questions from the 2005-06 Level II review as an additional reference for institutions producing their Level II written justification for the 2006-07 Level II review.

9. 2006-07 committee communications on financial aid to Division III membership. The committee reviewed a draft memorandum co-authored by the committee and NCAA staff outlining the confidentiality policies in place for the reporting process. The NCAA staff specifically noted that measures are in place to ensure institutional financial aid data, proprietary institutional information and institutional reporting-process correspondence remains confidential and secure throughout the reporting process and that institutions remain anonymous during the committee's review. The draft memorandum also outlined the potential ramifications of an institution sharing its financial aid variance and final detailed report with other institutions. The committee recommended that communication be made in spring 2007.

The committee also recommended that a communication on the prohibition of athletics ability, performance or participation as a leadership activity for financial aid packaging

purposes be made before January 2007. The committee recommended that this communication be sent to Division III admissions directors and financial aid directors to ensure institutional representatives overseeing admission and financial aid packaging decisions are reminded that athletics ability, participation or performance may be considered in admission decisions but may not be considered for financial aid packaging decisions.

10. Future meetings and teleconferences. The committee reviewed the future in-person meeting and teleconference schedule, noting that it has 30 Level II review cases for review in February 2007. Mr. Preston reminded committee members of recent teleconference meeting makers sent by NCAA staff that should be added to each committee member's 2007 calendar. The committee accepted this information.
11. Other business. The committee recognized Ms. Blodgett and Mr. Boyer for their exemplary service to the committee and to the Division III membership, noting that this meeting is their last in-person meeting with the committee.
12. Adjournment. Mr. Preston called for any other committee business and hearing none, adjourned the meeting at 11:13 a.m.

#