

MINUTES OF THE
NATIONAL COLLEGIATE ATHLETIC ASSOCIATION
DIVISION III FINANCIAL AID COMMITTEE

NCAA
Indianapolis, Indiana

February 15-16, 2007

Participants:

David Ellis, Emerson College
Travis Feezell, Macalester College
Sara Beth Holman, Lawrence University
Melissa Ibanez, University of Pittsburgh, Bradford
Kevin McHugh, The College of New Jersey
Joe Onderko, Presidents' Athletic Conference
Dan Preston, Linfield College, chair
Garnett Purnell, Wittenberg University
Ellen Shilkret, Vassar College
Debra Townsley, Nichols College
Richard Woodland, Rutgers, The State University of New Jersey, Camden
Matthew Banker, NCAA
Eric Hartung, NCAA
Jay Jones, NCAA
Ann Kearns, NCAA
Kristin Nesbitt, NCAA, recording secretary

Dan Dutcher, NCAA; Leah Nilsson, NCAA; and Crystal Rogers, NCAA, were in attendance for portions of this meeting. Those members of the committee who were prevented by severe weather from attending in person participated via teleconference.

[Note: These minutes contain only actions taken (formal votes or stated "sense of the meeting") in accordance with NCAA policy regarding minutes of all Association entities. While certain items on the committee's agenda were acted on at various times throughout the meeting, all final actions within a given topic are combined in these minutes for convenience of reference.]

Thursday, February 15

The meeting was called to order at 8:17 a.m. Eastern time by the chair, Mr. Preston.

NCAA Division III Financial Aid Committee

Minutes

February 15-16, 2007

Page No. 2

1. Welcome and announcements. Mr. Preston welcomed the NCAA Division III Financial Aid Committee members and advised the committee on logistical issues over the course of the two-day meeting. Mr. Preston welcomed Ms. Ibanez and Mr. Onderko to their first committee meeting. Each committee member and NCAA staff member introduced themselves to the full committee.
2. Review Financial Aid Committee roster. Mr. Preston referred to the 2006-07 Financial Aid Committee roster and instructed the committee to make NCAA staff aware of any edits to contact information.
3. Review November 2006 Financial Aid Committee minutes. Mr. Preston referred to the draft of the November 2-3, 2006, minutes. The committee reviewed the draft and took the following action:

It was VOTED

"To adopt the November 2-3, 2006, committee minutes."

4. Review financial aid reporting process timeline. The committee reviewed the reporting process timeline, noting that 2006-07 Level II review decisions made by the committee will be forwarded to Division III institutions by late March. The committee affirmed that a summary of the past two years' reporting statistics will be forwarded to the membership in order to facilitate comparisons between the first two years of the process.
5. Review financial aid reporting process procedural flowchart. The committee discussed the merits of moving back the financial aid reporting process submissions window for the upcoming year. NCAA staff advised the committee that as the number of institutions going through the reporting process increases, membership-wide technological improvements will easily accommodate an earlier deadline if such a decision is made. The committee postponed further discussion until the June teleconference.
6. Review Financial Aid Committee policies and procedures. The chair referred the committee to the guidelines listed in the policies and procedures, particularly confidentiality, and indicated that any suggestions for improvements could be forwarded to NCAA staff. The NCAA staff clarified the protocol for NCAA committees.

7. Review modifications of awarding entity references in financial aid legislation. The committee considered a modification of wording to NCAA Division III Bylaw 15 to create a uniform reference to the department, committee or entity that awards financial aid to Division III campuses.

It was VOTED

"To recommend a modification of wording to amend all provisions in Bylaw 15, which refer to the financial aid office to state 'financial aid office, regular college agency, office or committee.'"

8. Review financial aid legislation applicable to students or student-athletes. The committee discussed modifying the NCAA Division III Philosophy Statement to read "student-athletes" instead of "students" since the term "students" is broader and may exceed the intended scope of the legislation. The committee affirmed that Bylaw 15 addresses situations in which students were nonathlete members of the general student body before becoming student-athletes. The committee proposed removing any legislative references to "students" or "student-athletes" in the Division III Philosophy Statement for consistency.

It was VOTED

"To recommend a modification of wording to Bylaw 20.11(b) (Division III membership requirements) to state that Division III institutions shall 'award no financial aid on the basis of athletics ability, participation or performance.'"

9. Discuss legislative exception for demonstrating leadership in athletics activities. The committee discussed membership inquiries stating that excluding athletics from leadership-based award criterion disadvantages student-athletes, as well as the competing concern that liberalization could undermine the Division III prohibition on awarding athletically related financial aid. The committee noted that legislative history indicates that a majority of the Division III membership has consistently voted against creating an exception to the prohibition on athletically related financial aid. The committee declined to make a legislative recommendation on the issue until more input from the membership can be gathered. The committee noted that with the exception of a few vocal institutions on each side of the issue, a low volume of feedback from the membership has been received on the issue. The committee advised NCAA staff to inform them of the results of the NCAA Division III Virtual Focus Group survey on the issue. The committee will review the survey results in June and revisit the issue. No action taken.

10. Discuss state work study as a component in required data submission. The NCAA staff indicated that several institutions have mentioned confusion as to where state work study awards should be included in their financial aid reporting submissions. Institutions asked whether those awards should be reported under state or federal regulations. The NCAA staff noted that 14 states award state work study for an estimated total of \$81 million. The committee advised NCAA staff to include state work study under the same category as federal work study data submissions when compiling information.

11. Perform Level II reviews. The committee reviewed institutions that were forwarded from a Level I to a Level II review. The Level II review included evaluating the written justifications provided for financial aid variances and other data subsets within an institution's final detailed report to determine whether unjustifiable advantages were conferred to student-athletes in packaging financial aid based on athletics considerations. Mr. Preston and the NCAA staff reminded the committee that Level I review decisions result in one of three outcomes: (1) approve; (2) approve with conditions; or (3) forward to NCAA enforcement services based on unacceptable justification for an institution's variance.

The committee reviewed 30 Level II review cases and took the following actions:

It was VOTED

"To approve the following 21 2006-07 Level II review cases:

2005-1-05;	2005-2-10;
2005-3-14;	2005-3-16;
2006-1-02;	2006-1-03;
2006-1-04;	2006-1-08;
2006-1-09;	2006-1-17;
2006-1-19;	2006-1-22;
2006-1-24;	2006-2-05;
2006-2-11;	2006-3-03;
2006-3-04;	2006-3-05;
2006-3-06;	2006-3-07; and
2006-3-08."	

It was VOTED

"To approve with conditions the following 2006-07 Level II review case:

2006-1-06."

It was VOTED

"To request more information in regard to the following six 2006-07 Level II review cases:

2005-3-01;	2006-1-01;
2006-1-13;	2006-1-16;
2006-3-02; and	2006-3-09."

It was VOTED

"To forward to NCAA enforcement services the following two 2006-07 Level II review cases:

2005-4-04; and	2006-3-01."
----------------	-------------

[Note: During its Level II reviews, the committee recessed at 5:13 p.m. Thursday, February 15.]

Friday, February 16

The committee reconvened for Level II reviews and the remaining committee business at 8:05 a.m. Friday, February 16. All members were present as noted above.

12. Discuss Division III financial aid communication mediums and educational initiatives. The NCAA staff solicited committee member interest in assisting with presentations on financial aid legislation and the reporting process at several upcoming seminars and conferences. Mr. Preston summarized the Division III financial aid educational session held at the 2007 NCAA Convention, which included status updates on financial aid reporting and commonly asked questions about the process.
13. Review memorandum to Division III membership. The committee reviewed the memorandum to be sent to the membership related to consideration of athletics ability, participation or performance in awarding financial aid to student-athletes. The memorandum was sent in November 2006 to coincide with the beginning of financial aid award decisions at Division III campuses. A second memorandum will be sent this spring to chancellors and presidents, athletics directors and commissioners to address the confidentiality of the reporting process and the potential impact of sharing variance information with other institutions. The committee advised NCAA staff to incorporate suggested edits and submit a final draft for the committee's review before sending.

14. Review NCAA Division III Strategic Plan. The committee made a review of the global outcomes of the Strategic Plan, focusing on the sections of the plan impacting the Financial Aid Committee's role. The NCAA staff solicited feedback from the committee in regard to refinements of the financial aid reporting process in the areas of educational initiatives and enforcement involvement within the context of the Strategic Plan. Additional information in regard to filtering data by sport will be available at the March 14 teleconference. The committee discussed the possible impact of new divisional groupings or sub-groupings to the financial aid process.

15. Other business. Mr. Preston called for any other committee business. The NCAA staff is working to fill the remaining committee vacancies. The committee discussed a response to institutions that inquired about the athletics leadership issue. The committee deferred a decision on the issues of altering the reporting process data submission deadline to the June teleconference. Mr. Preston noted that this would be Mr. McHugh's final in-person meeting and thanked him for his service. The committee thanked Mr. Preston and the NCAA staff for their work in preparation for the committee meeting and the financial aid review process.

16. Future meetings and teleconferences.
 - a. Teleconference – 1 to 3 p.m. Eastern time March 14;
 - b. Teleconference – 1 to 3 p.m. Eastern time June 5; and
 - c. In-person meeting – November 5-6 (San Antonio, Texas).

17. Adjournment. Mr. Preston called for any other committee business and hearing none, adjourned the meeting at 10:34 a.m. Eastern time.

#